**Meeting Minutes**

**Tennessee State Textbook and Instructional Materials Quality Commission**

**Location:** Cordell Hull, House Hearing Room 3

**Date:** October 10, 2018

**Time:** 10:00am

**Roll Call**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Member** | **Present** | **Absent** |
| Dr. Vicki Kirk | x |  |
| Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman | x |  |
| Mr. Frank Cagle | x |  |
| Ms. Karen King | x |  |
| Ms. Kelsey Reece |  | x |
| Dr. Jack Parton, Vice Chairman | x |  |
| Ms. Kay Kelsey | x |  |
| Ms. Lynn Michelle Bowman | x |  |
| **Total** | 7 | 1 |

**Call to Order**

**Neel Durbin** called the meeting to order. Each member of the Textbook Commission introduced themselves to the audience and those watching the live stream.

**Consent Items (Voice Vote)**

* 1. **Adoption of Agenda**

**ACTION:** **Dr. Jack Parton** motioned, seconded by **Dr. Vicki Kirk** to approve the adoption of the agenda.

* 1. **September 14, 2018 Meeting Minutes**

**ACTION: Frank Cagle** motioned, seconded by **Jack Parton** to approve the September 14, 2018 meeting minutes as presented to the commission.

**Reviewer Recruitment Update**

**Lacey Noel** updated the commission on the Tennessee Department of Education’s efforts to recruit reviewers for the upcoming textbook adoption cycle. The February and April textbook training dates were mentioned, with **Neel Durbin** bringing up concern about the April training being around testing time for schools in Tennessee. **Lauren Bardwell** explained that the training will be held on a weekend so they will not be missing classroom time and that training the reviewers in April provides them more time to review the textbooks. **Michele Bowman** mentioned that the Tennessee Education Association could assist the department with their recruitment efforts.

1. **Publisher Appeal Discussion**
2. **B.E Publishing**

**Kay Kelsey** asked for further clarification on reviewer 27 and how they failed the textbook during the first review, but then passed the textbook after conducting the second review as well as during the requested reconvening. **Dr. Vicki Kirk** explained that the reviewer originally decided the book did not meet 80% of the standards, but that during the second and third review had agreed that the revised content covered enough of the standards to pass the textbook. **Kay Kelsey** commented that reviewer 27 was very thorough with their comments in their reconvening review. **Karen King** asked if there are other textbooks on the bid list that districts could purchase if this title was not approved, to which **Lacey Noel** said that there are other titles available on the official bid list.

1. **Pearson**

**Dr. Vicki Kirk** brought up that she noticed that only one standard had been failed by more than one reviewer, and that the other standards that failed only had one person who believed it was not covered and this made it clear that each reviewer thought the book was not passable for different reasons. **Frank Cagle** said it is hard to get a clear picture of what the reviewers had in mind unless you are able to read all of their comments. **Dr. Vicki Kirk** said it can be difficult to review each standard with every reviewer’s decision in mind to see if the majority passed that standard or not, but that it does give more clarity to the process. **Dr. Jack Parton** asked about the waiver process for districts, to which **Lacey Noel** explained the process of how districts could adopt a textbook that is not on our official adoption list.

1. **Cengage Learning**

**Karen King** asked for clarification on if the reconvening was the second or third time reviewer 34 reviewed the textbook. **Lacey Noel** explained that the reviewer passed the textbook during the first review in June, so the reconvening was their second time reviewing the book. **Kay Kelsey** inquired about if the comments in the reconvening where shared with both reviewers. **Lacey Noel** clarified that the comments from the second review were shared with both reviewers 28 and 34, but that reviewer 28 never sent a third review response to the department.

1. **EMC Publishing**

The commission asked for clarification on reviewer 39’s reconvening response. **Lacey Noel** explained that the publisher revised the textbook after the second review, adding 9 pages to the 2014 edition that is in the 2019 edition they are planning to substitute if the 2014 edition is approved which is why reviewer 39 approved the textbook during the reconvening. **Joanna Collins** read the substitution rule to the commission, and **Frank Cagle** inquired if there was a requirement for the publisher to submit the 2019 edition, to which **Joanna Collins** said no but that the publisher has said in their appeal that they were going to substitute the textbook. **Lauren Bardwell** explained that if the publisher submitted a substitution request, the department would review the title to make sure it could be taught side by side with the 2014 book.

1. **Studies Weekly**

**Lacey Noel** told the commission that the publisher made additional revisions to their textbook that is being appealed, but that the revisions were not reviewed because the commission only asked for a matrix. **Neel Durbin** said it was clear the majority of reviewer’s agreed this title should not pass, to which **Dr. Vicki Kirk** mentioned that there was only one standard that had a consensus that it should not pass. **Kay Kelsey** asked how many reviewers reviewed this text both times, and **Lacey Noel** said that all five of the reviewers had to re-review this title. **Lauren Bardwell** further explained that the second review was done prior to the textbook commission meeting, which is why the reviewers did not review the additional revisions the publisher made for their appeal in September.

1. **McGraw-Hill Education**

**Michele Bowman** commented on the reviewers who said there was extraneous content, stating that when students come from out-of-state schools, we are unsure what background information they have from the previous grade they were in before moving to Tennessee. She said having some information from what the students learned the year before may be helpful to students in those situations. **Vicki Kirk** mentioned that the reviewers said there was only 16 pages of extraneous content. **Neel Durbin** asked who sets the rules on the rubric the reviewer uses. **Dr. Kadie Patterson,** the Social Studies and World Language Coordinator for the department explained that the reviewers mentioned extraneous content because of complaints in the current textbooks, and it can appear that teachers are disregarding entire chapters of a textbook. **Lacey Noel** said that the department can work to change the review process with how reviews pass or fail a title. **Dr. Vicki Kirk** said we need to make sure we keep the process rigorous if anything is changed. **Lacey Noel** mentioned that there will be more flexibility with the screening instruments for the reviews next year.

1. **Action Items (Roll Call Vote)**
2. **BE Publishing Final Decision**

**ACTION: Approve the Business & Professional Communications textbook.**

**First Motion: Frank Cagle**

**Second Motion: Michele Bowman**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Member** | **Yes** | **No** | **Present Not Voting** |
| Ms. Kay Kelsey | x |  |  |
| Mr. Frank Cagle | x |  |  |
| Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education’s designee | x |  |  |
| Ms. Karen King  | x |  |  |
| Dr. Jack Parton | x |  |  |
| Ms. Michele Bowman  | x |  |  |
| Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman | x |  |  |

The motion passed unanimously

1. **Pearson Appeal Discussion**

**ACTION: Approve the Tennessee Economics textbook.**

**First Motion: Frank Cagle**

**Second Motion: Karen King**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Member** | **Yes** | **No** | **Present Not Voting** |
| Ms. Kay Kelsey | x |  |  |
| Mr. Frank Cagle | x |  |  |
| Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education’s designee | x |  |  |
| Ms. Karen King  | x |  |  |
| Dr. Jack Parton | x |  |  |
| Ms. Michele Bowman  | x |  |  |
| Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman | x |  |  |

The motion passed unanimously

1. **Cengage Learning Final Decision**

**ACTION: Approve the Burrow’s Business Management textbook.**

**First Motion: Frank Cagle**

**Second Motion: Michele Bowman**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Member** | **Yes** | **No** | **Present Not Voting** |
| Ms. Kay Kelsey | x |  |  |
| Mr. Frank Cagle | x |  |  |
| Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education’s designee | x |  |  |
| Ms. Karen King  | x |  |  |
| Dr. Jack Parton | x |  |  |
| Ms. Michele Bowman  | x |  |  |
| Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman | x |  |  |

The motion passed unanimously

1. **EMC Publishing Final Decision**

**ACTION: Approve the T’es branche’ Level 3 textbook.**

**First Motion: Jack Parton**

**Second Motion: Michele Bowman**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Member** | **Yes** | **No** | **Present Not Voting** |
| Ms. Kay Kelsey | x |  |  |
| Mr. Frank Cagle | x |  |  |
| Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education’s designee | x |  |  |
| Ms. Karen King  | x |  |  |
| Dr. Jack Parton | x |  |  |
| Ms. Michele Bowman  | x |  |  |
| Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman | x |  |  |

The motion passed unanimously

1. **Studies Weekly Final Decision**

**ACTION: Approve the Grade 3 Geography, Economics, and Early History textbook.**

**First Motion: Frank Cagle**

**Second Motion: Karen King**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Member** | **Yes** | **No** | **Present Not Voting** |
| Ms. Kay Kelsey | x |  |  |
| Mr. Frank Cagle | x |  |  |
| Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education’s designee | x |  |  |
| Ms. Karen King  | x |  |  |
| Dr. Jack Parton | x |  |  |
| Ms. Michele Bowman  | x |  |  |
| Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman | x |  |  |

The motion passed unanimously

1. **McGraw-Hill Education Final Decision**

**ACTION: Approve the Grade 7 World History and Geography: The Middle Ages to the 1770’s textbook.**

**First Motion: Michele Bowman**

**Second Motion: Karen King**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Member** | **Yes** | **No** | **Present Not Voting** |
| Ms. Kay Kelsey | x |  |  |
| Mr. Frank Cagle | x |  |  |
| Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education’s designee | x |  |  |
| Ms. Karen King  | x |  |  |
| Dr. Jack Parton | x |  |  |
| Ms. Michele Bowman  | x |  |  |
| Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman | x |  |  |

The motion passed unanimously

**Kay Kelsey** asked if this textbook had any other complaints besides the extraneous content. **Karen King** stated that she saw there were 20 places where standards were failed, but not as a majority.

1. **Recommendation of Section D Bid List as amended- Final Read**

**ACTION: Approve the Section D Adoption List as amended.**

**First Motion: Frank Cagle**

**Second Motion: Dr. Jack Parton**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Member** | **Yes** | **No** | **Present Not Voting** |
| Ms. Kay Kelsey | x |  |  |
| Mr. Frank Cagle | x |  |  |
| Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education’s designee | x |  |  |
| Ms. Karen King  | x |  |  |
| Dr. Jack Parton | x |  |  |
| Ms. Michele Bowman  | x |  |  |
| Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman | x |  |  |

The motion passed unanimously

**Announcements & Notices**

March 2019 Meeting Date: March 26th

Location TBD

**Other Business from the Commission**

**Dr. Jack Parton** applauded the department staff, textbook reviewers, and the commission for the work that was done for this textbook adoption cycle, saying that he has been a Director of Schools for 30 years and never knew all of the work that goes into our textbook adoption process until now. **Neel Durbin** said he has been impressed with the quick responses to his questions by the TDOE staff.

**Adjournment Time: 11:23am**