

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY



Project: White Oak Wildlife Management Area, Office Workbase Facility

Agency: Wildlife Resource Agency

Category: Standard

SBC Number: 220/017-02-2014

Project Approval Date: 11/13/2014

Total Project Budget: \$ 400,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 346,500.00

Designer Fee: \$ 27,642.00

Project Description: This project will provide the WMA in Region 1 with a new pre-engineered metal building containing office space for the Area Manager and open cubicle for two technical persons, restroom with shower and break room. Hazardous materials will be stored in the building. The new building will be approximately 1,200 square feet in area.

<u>Ranking</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
1)	Binkley Garcia Architecture & Interior Design – Provided numerous projects examples exhibiting experience with this type of project; project approach was well thought out; office in Nashville
2)	Vaughan Associates Architects, Inc. – Provided appropriate project examples exhibiting experience with this type of project; office in Jackson
3)	Burr & Cole Consulting Engineers, Inc. – Have worked with metal buildings; architectural discipline to be subcontracted; Memphis office.

Other Firms Submitted: HFR Design

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

②

Project: Region 2 Facilities ADA Compliance – Various Facilities

Agency: Wildlife Resource Agency

Category: Standard

SBC Number: 220/018-02-2014

Project Approval Date: 11/13/2014

Total Project Budget: \$ 1,000,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 847,000.00

Designer Fee: \$ 77,558.00

Project Description: This project will bring approximately (18) TWRA facilities in Region 2 into compliance with the American Disability Act. Upgrades and renovations will include as an example, restroom facilities, egress conditions, parking, and pathways of travel, curb cuts and approaches to the various facilities. Within the facilities signage and alarm warning devices shall be reviewed and made compliant.

<u>Ranking</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
1)	Binkley Garcia Architecture & Interior Design – Firm’s location in Nashville is ideal for this project; they are experienced working with the State and TWRA; proposed team has experience working on these types of projects.
2)	Street Dixon Rick Architecture, LLC. – Firm appears to be qualified to complete the work of this project. Some concerns about potential workload if awarded other projects.
3)	Goodwyn Mills Cawood – Firm and proposed team are qualified to complete work of this project; work load appears to be heavy and is of concern.

Other Firms Submitted: Johnson + Associates Architects, LLC.



DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: Backup Generator Installation – Tennessee Fire Service and Codes Enforcement Academy

Agency: Commerce & Insurance

Category: Minor

SBC Number: 700/001-01-2014

Project Approval Date: 06/12/2014

Total Project Budget: \$ 550,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 369,916.00

Designer Fee: \$ 29,305.00

Project Description: This project will provide the Dormitory and Dining Hall with two backup diesel powered electrical generators. The Dormitory will require a 150KW and the Dining Hall will require a 200KW generator. Both generators will require automatic transfer switches in each buildings main electrical equipment room. The project will require trenching for the power lines from the generator. The generator for the Dining Hall will be located adjacent to electrical equipment room. Trenching will be in earth. The generator for the Dormitory will be located across the roadway from the electrical equipment room and will require trenching through pavement.

<u>Ranking</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
1)	Smith Seckman Reid, Inc. - has experience with multiple emergency generator installations and with the State procurement process. They have identified their architectural sub-consultant, Mackie Shanks, Architect for modifications to the buildings.
2)	N/A
3)	N/A

Other Firms Submitted: Win Engineering, LLC



Tennessee Board of Regents

Office of Facilities Development

Suite 664 at 1415 Murfreesboro Road in Nashville, Tennessee 37217-2833
(615) 366 – 4431 FAX (615) 366 – 3992

Designer Recommendations

Project: TTU Residence Halls Upgrades
Category: Standard
Total Budget: 6,480,000
MACC: 5,555,000
Designer Fee: 590,412
SBC Project No: 166/011-08-2015

Replace the mechanical and plumbing systems, electrical switchgear and related service components. Renovate bathrooms. Replace doors and hardware. Replace windows on the first floor. Update materials & finishes throughout building. Provide additional code compliant exits from ground floors. Abate asbestos materials as necessary. An environmental consultant for asbestos and hazardous materials is required as a part of basic services. This will be a multi-phase project with work to be completed in two residence halls. This MACC represents 1/2 of the total project.

1. Maffett Loftis Engineering, LLC

Firm has completed three dorm renovation projects of similar size, scope, and complexity. All are primarily engineering projects similar to this project. All team members, including mechanical, electrical, and plumbing are consistent, having worked together on all of the referenced similar scope projects. Consultants are consistent on all of the referenced projects and have similar project experience to the proposed project. The consultants include architectural, structural, and environmental.

2. HFR Design, Inc.

Firm has completed three general housing renovation projects of similar size. Most of the team members have worked together on the referenced project and include architectural, structural, civil, and interior design. Consultants have similar project experience and have worked with the team. The consultants include mechanical, electrical, plumbing, and environmental.

3. Street Dixon Rick Architecture, PLC

Firm has referenced similar project experience on three dorm renovations without any clarification on the size of these projects. Firm members have similar project experience but have not worked together on all of the referenced projects, including the three dorm renovations. Firm and consultants have previously worked together but are not consistent on the referenced projects. Consultants include structural, mechanical, electrical, plumbing, and environmental.

A total of 18 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
Adams Craft Herz Walker, Inc.	Oak Ridge
Architects Weeks Ambrose McDonald, Inc.	Knoxville
Bauer Askew Architecture, pllc	Nashville

Cope Associates, Inc. Architecture	Knoxville
EOA Architects	Nashville
Gilbert/McLaughlin/Casella Architects	Nashville
Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood, Inc.	Nashville
HFR Design, Inc.	Brentwood
I.C. Thomasson Associates, Inc.	Nashville
Johnson + Associates, LLC	Goodlettsville
Kline Swinney Associates	Nashville
Maffett Loftis Engineering, LLC	Cookeville
Michael Brady, Inc.	Knoxville
Red Chair Architects, Inc.	Knoxville
Smith Seckman Reid, Inc.	Nashville
Sparkman & Associates Architects, Inc.	Knoxville
Street Dixon Rick Architecture, PLC	Nashville
The Lewis Group Architects, Inc., P.C.	Knoxville



5

Tennessee Board of Regents

Office of Facilities Development

Suite 664 at 1415 Murfreesboro Road in Nashville, Tennessee 37217-2833
(615) 366 – 4431 FAX (615) 366 – 3992

Designer Recommendations

Project: CoSCC Campus Site Improvements
Category: Minor
Total Budget: 490,000
MACC: 440,000
Designer Fee: 42,840
SBC Project No: 166/015-03-2015

Install permeable pavers, irrigation, seating, landscaping, and lighting in areas public areas.

1. Hiebert + Ball Land Design

Four of the five projects listed are similar in scope. The projects emphasize designing for a student population at higher education campuses. The team that is proposed is the same as the team proposed for this project.

2. Hodgson Douglas LLC

Three of the five projects listed are similar in scope. Two of the projects were master plans. Designs were developed for a student environment. The principal is consistent, but the project manager is not listed on any of the similar projects.

3. Al Wilkinson Landscape Architect

Five projects are similar in scope to the proposed project, although the details of the scope are limited. The projects are designed for a wide range of community groups. The design team is consistent on all projects

A total of 3 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
Al Wilkinson Landscape Architect	Greenbrier
Hiebert + Ball Land Design	Franklin
Hodgson Douglas LLC	Nashville