

**DATE:** January 29, 2015

**SUBJECT:** Academic Program Review

**ACTION RECOMMENDED:** Information

As Tennessee’s institutions of higher education continue to focus on the goals of completion and student success, there is a clear need for an ongoing evaluation of the state’s academic programs. Recent years have seen a period of extensive growth in the current academic program inventory coupled with the concerns that a significant number of programs are failing to meet productivity thresholds. In January 2014, THEC notified the Tennessee Board of Regents and the University of Tennessee of a 12-month moratorium on new academic programs beginning July 2014. This six-month period allowed the governing boards to submit program proposals that were currently being developed by faculty and administrators to the THEC staff for evaluation.

The moratorium allowed THEC to work jointly with each system to assess the health of academic offerings, make necessary adjustments to academic program policy, and ensure that all programs are fully aligned for student success. As the state continue to move toward 55 percent of Tennesseans obtaining a college degree or certificate by 2025, it is vital that our institutions of higher education provide students with high quality academic programs.

The Academic Program Review provides a holistic view of the status of degree programs throughout the state, and includes the following components:

- **Program Activity:** Depicts new programs added to the state inventory in 2014, as well as programs that have been terminated.
- **Post Approval Monitoring:** Assesses success of new programs approved within the last five years against projected enrollment and graduation benchmarks.
- **Performance Funding Qualitative Reviews:** Results of accreditation reviews, consultant evaluations, or academic audits of established programs as a Performance Funding qualitative measure.
- **Program Productivity Review:** On-going monitoring of all programs in operation for more than five years is conducted to identify those that are not graduating a sufficient number of students as well as those programs that are thriving.

## 1) Program Activity

The Commission has the statutory responsibility to review and approve new academic programs, while responsibility for program termination lies with the two governing boards. However, Commission staff may recommend termination to the TBR and UT systems.

During 2014, the Commission approved seven programs and the Board of Regents approved 27 pre-baccalaureate programs. The governing boards terminated 15 programs.

A complete listing of program approvals and terminations can be found in Appendix A.

**Table 1: New Programs and Terminations, 2014**

	<b>New Programs</b>	<b>Terminations</b>	<b>Net Change</b>
TBR Universities	7	3	4
UT System	0	3	-3
TBR Community Colleges	27	9	18
<b>Total Actions</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>19</b>

- Of the 34 new programs, the majority were certificate and associate degree programs approved by the Board of Regents.
- Program approval activity for 2014 remained stable in comparison to 2013. During 2013, there were 37 new program approvals with two new programs approved for the UT System.
- THEC approved four graduate programs and three programs at the baccalaureate level. Each of these programs was approved under the more rigorous program approval process instituted in 2011 and is congruent with the institutional mission profile.
- Overall termination activity was high in comparison to programs terminated in 2013. Termination activity consisted of three bachelor's programs and three graduate programs at the public universities. During 2013, only five programs were terminated.

## 2) Post Approval Monitoring

Newly approved programs are evaluated under the Post Approval Monitoring (PAM) cycle for five years at the baccalaureate level and above and three years for pre-baccalaureate programs. Effective with the revised academic policy, doctoral programs will be monitored for a seven-year period. This review evaluates programs against enrollment and graduate projections, program cost, and other goals agreed upon by the governing boards and THEC.

Benchmarks for programs are developed by each institution and failure to meet these benchmarks can impact the institution substantially. For example, if the institution does not enroll the projected number of students then there may be a deficit in tuition receipts, and thus, a financial burden to the institution.

THEC can recommend termination for those programs that do not, over the monitoring period, show improvement.

**Table 2: Summary of Post Approval Monitoring**

	<b>Programs Meeting Benchmarks</b>	<b>Programs Not Meeting Benchmarks</b>	<b>Delayed Programs</b>
TBR Universities	11	15	--
UT System	3	3	1
TBR Community Colleges	6	19	3
<b>Total</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>37</b>	<b>4</b>

The full summary of Post Approval Monitoring can be found in Appendix B.

Of the 57 programs reviewed during the 2014 Post Approval Monitoring cycle, 20 programs or 35 percent met the projections listed in the program proposal or exceeded productivity benchmarks. This is a slight increase from the percentage of programs that achieved benchmarks during 2013.

However, many under-performing programs are meeting at least one of the benchmarks in either enrollment or graduation. This was the case in 22 of the 57 monitored programs that failed to meet benchmarks.

In the remaining 15 under-performing programs, both enrollment and graduation benchmarks are not being met, indicating that the program is in true peril of failing to reach the institutionally developed projections that indicate success.

Perhaps the greatest concerns emerge when a program is completing the 5 year Post Approval Monitoring Cycle, yet has failed to achieve the benchmarks set out in the program proposal. The full summary of Under-Performing Programs Completing Monitoring Cycle can be found in Table 3. Not only are these under-performing but they also are considered low producing programs.

**Table 3: Under-Performing Programs Completing Monitoring Cycle**

<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program/ Degree Level</b>	<b>Projected Graduates during PAM Cycle</b>	<b>Actual Graduates during PAM Cycle</b>	<b>Average Graduates during PAM Cycle</b>
Austin Peay	Chemical Eng Tech, AAS	231	131	26
Middle Tennessee	Forensic Science, BS	30	11	2
Middle Tennessee	Computational Science, PhD	6	0	--
Middle Tennessee	Molecular Biosciences, PhD	4	0	--
Walters State	Clean Energy Tech, AAS	20	2	--

There are various reasons why programs may not meet projected benchmarks. Sometimes the implementation of programs are delayed due to difficulty hiring faculty, inadequate recruitment practices, changes in labor market demands, or other issues not within the control of the institution. For example, Hemlock Semiconductor has been the primary employer for graduates of the Chemical Engineering Technology program at APSU. When the plant closed, the program was directly impacted and the result is a significant reduction in the number of students completing the degree.

Programs that did not meet benchmarks during the monitoring period completed a Program Productivity Plan that addressed deficiencies and provided specific plans for corrective actions. Although the Program Productivity Plan serves to help improve the program, many of these under-performing programs will ultimately move from the PAM Cycle to the low producing listing of academic programs.

In the January 2014 Academic Program Review report, five programs completed their final year of post-approval monitoring. However, these programs failed to meet both enrollment and graduation benchmarks and therefore remained on monitoring status during 2014. These programs and their current status are reflected in Table 4.

**Table 4: Under-Performing Programs: Monitoring Cycle Extended**

<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Average Graduates during PAM Cycle</b>
East Tennessee State University	Early Childhood Education, PhD	--
<i>Status:</i> Enrollment has increased to 23 students and anticipates awarding 4 degrees in 2015.		
Middle Tennessee State University	Literacy Studies, PhD	1
<i>Status:</i> Program is making significant improvement with 10 degrees awarded in 2013-14 and 34 doctoral students currently enrolled.		
Tennessee State University	Urban Studies, BS	2
<i>Status:</i> Enrollment has increased to 24 students and anticipates awarding 10 degrees in 2016.		
University of Memphis	Architecture, MS	3
<i>Status:</i> Program is making good progress towards the expected five graduates for Master's degree programs with the awarding of four degrees in 2013-14.		
UT Knoxville	Nutritional Sciences, PhD	2
<i>Status:</i> This program is making significant improvement with three degrees awarded in 2013-14 and five students have defended their dissertations during the summer/fall 2014 terms.		

### 3) Performance Funding Qualitative Reviews

The THEC Performance Funding Quality Assurance program requires institutions to evaluate undergraduate and graduate programs against a range of measures, ensuring that all degree programs provide an appropriately rigorous academic pathway and meet established national quality measures.

As the completion agenda continues, it is necessary to provide a clear assurance that the quality of academic programs is sustained. This assurance is provided via two primary methods:

- Academic audit/program review process
- Accreditation status

**Academic Program Review:** The purpose of academic program review is to ensure that standards of the discipline are being met and adequate financial support is evident. Each program is reviewed according to accreditation review cycles or at least once every five to seven years by THEC program evaluation criteria.

**Table 5: Academic Program Evaluation by Type, 2013-14**

	<b>Traditional Program Review</b>	<b>Academic Audit</b>
TBR Universities	27	15
UT System	40	0
TBR Community Colleges	6	25
<b>Total</b>	<b>73</b>	<b>40</b>

Traditional program reviews are conducted by a qualified, out of state faculty member that provides an external review of program performance. These reviewers are approved by system staff and THEC staff, and provide a unique perspective to assist institutions in the quality assurance process. The UT system solely utilizes the program review process for program evaluation.

Academic Audits are carried out by select TBR faculty evaluators, and follow a prescribed process to determine program health in learning objectives, curriculum, teaching and learning, student learning assessment, quality assurance, overall assessment, previous audit response, and support. Effective with the 2010-15 performance funding cycle, associate degree programs that contain embedded certificates are evaluated as part of the respective associate degree program.

**Accreditation Status:** Accreditation by a professional, discipline specific accreditor is perhaps the most rigorous evaluation of an academic program. These accreditors, all of whom are approved by THEC, provide invaluable subject-specific insight into whether programs are truly preparing students for success in their selected field.

Across both systems, 587 programs are eligible for accreditation. Eligibility is determined when all Tennessee institutions agree on a specific accreditor as best representing qualitative standards for each discipline.

Currently, all programs are accredited, except for newly approved programs (56) and one program in which accreditation has been rescinded. This results in 99 percent of the eligible programs being either accredited or in the process of seeking accreditation. In the sole instance where accreditation was not achieved, the institution’s performance funding score was negatively impacted.

The accreditation status of Tennessee’s public institutions is available for review in Appendix C.

#### 4) Program Productivity Review

With the announcement of the moratorium in January 2014, THEC staff conducted a detailed analysis of each institution’s academic program offerings. This review included an analysis of new programs (Post Approval Monitoring) and mature program productivity. Results from this review were then compiled into a comprehensive report for system and institutional leaders to utilize during the evaluation process. THEC requested the governing boards to carefully review the program productivity data (2008-09 through 2012-13) and asked for a determination of program action recommendation (retention, consolidation, inactivation, or termination).

This review of program productivity data identified programs that were not meeting nationally-identified graduate production benchmarks:

- Average of ten graduates per year over a five-year period for baccalaureate and pre-baccalaureate programs
- Average of five graduates for master’s programs over five-years, and
- Average of three graduates for doctoral programs over this same period of time.

**Table 6: Program Productivity Review**

	<b>Total Program Offerings</b>	<b>Programs Meeting Benchmarks</b>	<b>% Programs Meeting Benchmarks</b>	<b>Low-Producing Programs</b>
TBR Universities	630	587	93%	43
UT System	414	352	85%	62
TBR Community Colleges	535	446	83%	89
<b>Total</b>	<b>1579</b>	<b>1385</b>	<b>88%</b>	<b>196</b>

- The State’s academic program inventory includes close to 1600 programs with approximately 1400 programs or 88 percent achieving the national benchmarks.
- At the universities, 105 programs did not achieve the projected benchmarks. The distribution of these programs were almost equally divided between undergraduate (58 programs) and graduate programs (47 programs).

- The majority of the graduate programs that did not achieve the minimum graduation were Master's degree programs. However, all of the Master's program offerings at Austin Peay, Middle Tennessee, Tennessee State, UT Chattanooga and UT Martin achieved on average five graduates over the five-year period.
- Seven of the 29 under-performing Master's programs achieved on average two graduates during the reporting period. These seven programs were at East Tennessee, UT Knoxville and UT Health Science Center. All programs were either in the biological sciences or the health fields.
- Doctoral programs that have achieved maturity are expected to achieve three graduates annually. The productivity study revealed that 18 doctoral programs were under-performing. Primarily the Engineering doctoral programs did not achieve the average benchmark.
- Of the close to 90 low-producing programs at the community colleges, 16 programs were recommended for termination. The majority of the programs terminated were three RODP programs: Web Technology (Associate), Web Page Authoring (Certificate) and Professional Studies (Associate). These program terminations occurred at six community colleges.
- The community colleges recommended 48 under-performing programs be retained with submission of action plans to increase productivity. For example, the Associate of Science Teaching program that is offered at four of the community colleges submitted a common corrective action plan to focus on ways to prepare students for passing the required PRAXIS I exam.

The overall program productivity status of Tennessee's public institutions is available for review in Appendix D. Appendix E provides the inventory of under-performing programs along with the governing board's recommendations.

The Academic Program Review included analysis of not only under-performing programs, but also sought to identify those programs which are highly productive and are worthy of mention as successful academic programs at each institution.

The distribution of productive programs among four year institutions was diverse, ranging from health professions programs to interdisciplinary programs intended for adult students.

However, among community colleges, the General Transfer Associate degree intended to prepare students for admission to a four year university was the most productive program. This indicates that the vast majority of degrees awarded at the associate level are to students likely seeking to fulfill the general education requirements of a bachelor's degree program.

**Top Producing Programs by Institution  
Based on 5-Year Average (2008-09 through 2012-13)**

**Tennessee Board of Regents - Universities**

---

Austin Peay State University

- Bachelor Business Admin, BBA
- Master's Teaching, MAT

East Tennessee State University

- Bachelor Nursing, BSN
- Master's Nursing, MSN
- Doctoral Pharmacy, PharmD

Middle Tennessee State University

- Bachelor Liberal Studies, BS
- Master's Curriculum and Instruction, MEd
- Doctoral Human Performance, PhD

Tennessee State University

- Bachelor Teacher Education, BS
- Master's Nursing, MSN
- Doctoral Doctor of Physical Therapy, DPT

Tennessee Technological University

- Bachelor Teacher Education, BS
- Master's Instructional Leadership, MA
- Doctoral Engineering, PhD

University of Memphis

- Bachelor Professional Studies, BS
- Master's Instructional Leadership, MAT/MS
- Doctoral Psychology, PhD and Business Administration, PhD

**University of Tennessee System**

---

University of Tennessee- Chattanooga

- Bachelor Business Administration, BS
- Master's Business Administration, MBA
- Doctoral Doctor of Physical Therapy, DPT

University of Tennessee- Knoxville

- Bachelor Psychology, BA
- Master's Business Administration, MBA
- Doctoral Education, PhD

University of Tennessee- Martin

- Bachelor Individualized Program, BS
- Master's Business Administration, MBA

University of Tennessee Health Science Center

- Bachelor Nursing, BSN
- Master's Nursing, MSN
- Doctoral Pharmacy, PharmD

**Appendix A**  
**2014 Program Activity Report: New Programs**

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>
<b>1</b>	Austin Peay	Engineering Technology	Masters
<b>2</b>	Austin Peay	Theatre/Dance	Bachelors
<b>3</b>	East Tennessee	Digital Marketing	Masters
<b>4</b>	East Tennessee	Graphic Design	Baccalaureate
<b>5</b>	Middle Tennessee	Theatre	Baccalaureate
<b>6</b>	Tennessee State	Computer Science	Masters
<b>7</b>	Univ of Memphis	Health Systems and Policy	Doctoral
<b>8</b>	Chattanooga	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>9</b>	Cleveland	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>10</b>	Cleveland	Medical Informatics	Associate
<b>11</b>	Cleveland	Paramedic	Certificate
<b>12</b>	Cleveland	Paramedic	Associate
<b>13</b>	Columbia	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>14</b>	Columbia	Early Childhood Education (RODP)	Associate
<b>15</b>	Dyersburg	Mechatronics: Programmable Logic	Certificate
<b>16</b>	Dyersburg	Mechatronics: Industrial Electricity	Certificate
<b>17</b>	Dyersburg	Mechatronics: Mechanical Components I	Certificate
<b>18</b>	Dyersburg	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>19</b>	Jackson	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>20</b>	Motlow	Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>21</b>	Motlow	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>22</b>	Nashville	Police Administration	Certificate
<b>23</b>	Northeast	Entrepreneurship	Certificate
<b>24</b>	Northeast	Customer Service and Sales	Certificate
<b>25</b>	Pellissippi	Computer Aided Manufacturing	Certificate
<b>26</b>	Roane	Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>27</b>	Roane	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>28</b>	Roane	Medical Informatics	Associate
<b>29</b>	Roane	Financial Services	Associate
<b>30</b>	Southwest	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>31</b>	Volunteer	Veterinary Assistant	Certificate
<b>32</b>	Volunteer	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate
<b>33</b>	Volunteer	Computer Information Technology	Associate
<b>34</b>	Walters	Advanced Emergency Medical Technician	Certificate

**Appendix A**  
**2014 Program Activity: Terminated Programs**

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>
<b>1</b>	Middle Tennessee	Office Management	Baccalaureate
<b>2</b>	Univ of Memphis	Applied Computer Science	Masters
<b>3</b>	Univ of Memphis	Merchandising and Consumer Sciences	Masters
<b>4</b>	UT Chattanooga	Rehabilitation Sciences	Baccalaureate
<b>5</b>	UT Knoxville	Industrial/Organizational Psychology	Doctorate
<b>6</b>	UT Martin	French	Baccalaureate
<b>7</b>	Nashville	Social Services	Associate
<b>8</b>	Roane	Composite Materials	Certificate
<b>9</b>	Southwest	Homeland Security	Certificate
<b>10</b>	Southwest	Home Manager	Certificate
<b>11</b>	Volunteer	Animal Care Technology	Certificate
<b>12</b>	Volunteer	Pre-Allied Health	Certificate
<b>13</b>	Volunteer	General Education Core	Certificate
<b>14</b>	Volunteer	Web Page Authoring	Certificate
<b>15</b>	Volunteer	Web Technology	Associate

**Appendix B**  
**2013-14 Post Approval Monitoring**

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Met Enrollment Benchmark</b>	<b>Met Graduation Benchmark</b>	<b>Met No Benchmarks</b>
1	Austin Peay	Professional Science Masters, PSM	X	--	
2	Austin Peay	Chemical Engineering Tech, Associate			X
3	East Tennessee	Appalachian Studies, MA		--	
4	East Tennessee	Bluegrass, OT & CM Studies, BA	X		
5	East Tennessee	Geosciences, MS	X	X	
6	East Tennessee	International Affairs, BA	X	X	
7	East Tennessee	Sports Physiology and Performance, PhD	X	X	
8	Middle Tennessee	Assessment, Learning, and School Improvement, PhD	X	--	
9	Middle Tennessee	Management, MS		--	
10	Middle Tennessee	Mechatronics Engineering, BS	X	--	
11	Middle Tennessee	Computational Science, PhD	X		
12	Middle Tennessee	Exercise Science, BS	X	X	
13	Middle Tennessee	Forensic Science, BS	X		
14	Middle Tennessee	Horse Science, MS		X	
15	Middle Tennessee	Information Systems, MS	X	X	
16	Middle Tennessee	International Affairs, MA		X	
17	Middle Tennessee	Leisure and Sport Management, MS	X	X	
18	Middle Tennessee	Math & Science Education, PhD	X	X	
19	Middle Tennessee	Molecular Biosciences, PhD	X		
20	Tennessee State	Public Health, MPH			X
21	Tennessee Tech	Environmental/ Sustainability, BS	X	X	
22	Tennessee Tech	Professional Science Masters, PSM		X	
23	Univ of Memphis	Epidemiology, PhD	X		
24	Univ of Memphis	Interior Design, BFA		X	
25	Univ of Memphis	Social Work, MSW		X	
26	Univ of Memphis	Social/Behavioral Science, PhD			X
27	UT Chattanooga	Athletic Training, MS	X	X	
28	UT Chattanooga	Doctor of Nursing Practice, DNP			X
29	UT Chattanooga	Integrated Studies, BS	X	X	
30	UT Chattanooga	Mathematics, MS	X	X	
31	UT Knoxville	Doctor of Nursing, DNP	X		
32	UT Knoxville	Energy Science/Eng. Engineering, PhD	X		
33	ROCC	Criminal Justice, Associate			X
34	Chattanooga	Applied Science, Associate		X	
35	Chattanooga	Fine Arts, Associate		X	
36	Chattanooga	Health Sciences, Associate	X	X	
37	Chattanooga	Process Technology, Certificate		X	

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Met Enrollment Benchmark</b>	<b>Met Graduation Benchmark</b>	<b>Met No Benchmarks</b>
38	Cleveland	Health Sciences, Associate			X
39	Cleveland	Fine Arts, Associate			X
40	Columbia	Adv. Integrated Industrial Tech, Associate	X		
41	Columbia	Fine Arts, Associate			X
42	Columbia	Health Sciences, Associate	X	X	
43	Dyersburg	Fine Arts, Associate			X
44	Motlow	Mechatronics Technology, Associate		X	
45	Nashville	Medical Informatics, Associate	X		
46	Nashville	Fine Arts, Associate			X
47	Nashville	Health Sciences, Associate	X		
48	Pellissippi	Fine Arts, Associate	X		
49	Pellissippi	Health Sciences, AAS			X
50	Roane	Fine Arts, Associate			X
51	Southwest	Advanced Integrated Ind Tech, Associate			X
52	Volunteer	Entertainment Media Production, Associate	X	--	
53	Volunteer	Fine Arts, Associate	X	--	
54	Volunteer	Medical Informatics, Associate	X	--	
55	Volunteer	Vet Tech, Associate	X	X	
56	Walters	Fine Arts, Associate			X
57	Walters	Clean Energy Technology, Associate			X

### 2013-14 Post Approval Monitoring: Delayed Programs

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>
1	UT Chattanooga	Occupational Therapy	Doctoral
2	Chattanooga	International Business	Certificate
3	Jackson	Occupational Therapy Assistant	Associate
4	Walters	Occupational Therapy Assistant	Associate

**Appendix C**  
**2013-14 Accreditation Status**

<b>Institution</b>	<b>Accreditable Programs</b>	<b>Accredited Programs</b>	<b>Programs Seeking Accreditation</b>	<b>Programs Failed Accreditation</b>
Austin Peay	27	21	6	
East Tennessee	60	52	7	1
Middle Tennessee	55	49	6	
Tennessee State	44	43	1	
Tennessee Tech	35	34	1	
Univ of Memphis	72	69	3	
<b>TBR Universities</b>	<b>293</b>	<b>268</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>1</b>
UT Chattanooga	37	36	1	
UT Knoxville	66	62	4	
UT Martin	23	22	1	
<b>UT System</b>	<b>126</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>
Chattanooga	27	25	2	
Cleveland	5	3	2	
Columbia	11	7	4	
Dyersburg	8	4	4	
Jackson	10	8	2	
Motlow	7	2	5	
Nashville	12	11	1	
Northeast	10	10	0	
Pellissippi	7	6	1	
Roane	18	16	2	
Southwest	23	22	1	
Volunteer	16	15	1	
Walters	14	13	1	
<b>TBR Comm Colleges</b>	<b>168</b>	<b>142</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>587</b>	<b>530</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>1</b>

**Appendix D  
2014 Program Productivity**

	<b>Total Program Offerings</b>	<b>Low- Producing Programs</b>	<b>Low- Producing Programs Retained</b>	<b>Programs Terminated</b>	<b>% Programs Meeting Benchmarks</b>
Austin Peay	60	3	3	0	95%
East Tennessee	130	16	15	1	88%
Middle Tennessee	128	5	4	1	96%
Tennessee State	81	6	5	0	93%
Tennessee Tech	67	7	7	0	90%
Univ of Memphis	164	6	6	0	96%
<b>TBR Universities</b>	<b>630</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>93%</b>
UT Chattanooga	96	12	11	1	89%
UT Knoxville	241	34	30	4	86%
UT Martin	42	9	8	1	79%
UT Health Science Center	35	8	8	0	77%
<b>UT System</b>	<b>414</b>	<b>63</b>	<b>57</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>85%</b>
<b>Total Universities</b>	<b>1044</b>	<b>106</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>90%</b>
Chattanooga	76	13	13	0	83%
Cleveland	39	4	1	3	90%
Columbia	28	6	6	0	89%
Dyersburg	31	6	6	0	81%
Jackson	21	6	6	0	71%
Motlow	18	4	4	0	78%
Nashville	51	15	11	4	71%
Northeast	34	5	5	0	85%
Pellissippi	59	1	1	0	98%
Roane	37	7	4	3	81%
Southwest	53	11	10	1	79%
Volunteer	45	3	1	2	93%
Walters	43	8	5	3	81%
<b>TBR Comm Colleges</b>	<b>535</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>73</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>83%</b>
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>1579</b>	<b>195</b>	<b>170</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>88%</b>

## Appendix E Under-Performing Programs

	Institution	CIP Code	Academic Program	Average	Board Recommendation
	<b>Benchmark for Pre- and Baccalaureate Programs: 10 graduates over a 5 year period</b>				
<b>1</b>	Austin Peay	15.0000	Engineering Tech (associate)	2.0	Retain
<b>2</b>	Austin Peay	38.0101	Philosophy	3.4	Retain
<b>3</b>	Austin Peay	40.0801	Physics	8.6	Retain
<b>4</b>	East Tennessee	05.0207	Women's Studies	1.8	Retain
<b>5</b>	East Tennessee	50.0501	Theatre	4.8	Retain
<b>6</b>	East Tennessee	45.0601	Economics	5.0	Retain
<b>7</b>	East Tennessee	51.2202	Environmental Health	5.4	Retain
<b>8</b>	East Tennessee	40.0601	Geology	5.8	Retain
<b>9</b>	East Tennessee	40.0801	Physics	7.6	Retain
<b>10</b>	East Tennessee	45.0701	Geography	8.2	Terminate
<b>11</b>	East Tennessee	38.0101	Philosophy	8.4	Retain
<b>12</b>	East Tennessee	50.0408	Interior Design	8.5	Retain
<b>13</b>	East Tennessee	52.0601	Economics	8.8	Retain
<b>14</b>	Middle Tennessee	50.0703	Art History	3.8	Retain
<b>15</b>	Middle Tennessee	52.0204	Office Management	5.0	Terminate
<b>16</b>	Middle Tennessee	15.0303	Environmental Science & Tech	5.2	Retain
<b>17</b>	Middle Tennessee	30.9999	Integrative Studies	5.8	Retain
<b>18</b>	Middle Tennessee	40.0801	Physics	7.0	Retain
<b>19</b>	Tennessee State	13.1210	Early Childhood Education	5.4	Retain
<b>20</b>	Tennessee State	14.0401	Architectural Engineering	6.0	Retain
<b>21</b>	Tennessee State	27.0101	Mathematics	6.6	Retain
<b>22</b>	Tennessee State	15.0801	Aeronautical & Industrial Tech	8.0	Retain
<b>23</b>	Tennessee Tech	40.0801	Physics	3.6	Retain
<b>24</b>	Tennessee Tech	52.0601	Economics	4.2	Retain
<b>25</b>	Tennessee Tech	30.9999	International Business & Culture	7.8	Retain
<b>26</b>	Tennessee Tech	27.0101	Mathematics	9.4	Retain
<b>27</b>	Univ of Memphis	40.0801	Physics	1.8	Retain
<b>28</b>	Univ of Memphis	50.0703	Art History	5.6	Retain
<b>29</b>	Univ of Memphis	14.0901	Computer Engineering	6.8	Retain
<b>30</b>	UT Chattanooga	27.0101	Mathematics	1.0	Retain
<b>31</b>	UT Chattanooga	13.1302	Art Education	2.4	Consolidate
<b>32</b>	UT Chattanooga	40.0801	Physics	3.2	Retain
<b>33</b>	UT Chattanooga	50.0501	Theatre	4.4	Retain
<b>34</b>	UT Chattanooga	50.0901	Music	6.2	Retain
<b>35</b>	UT Chattanooga	27.0301	Applied Mathematics	6.4	Retain

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>CIP Code</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Average</b>	<b>Board Recommendation</b>
	<b>Benchmark for Pre- and Baccalaureate Programs: 10 graduates over a 5 year period</b>				
<b>36</b>	UT Chattanooga	40.0601	Geology	6.4	Retain
<b>37</b>	UT Chattanooga	38.9999	Philosophy & Religion	7.0	Retain
<b>38</b>	UT Chattanooga	13.1001	Exceptional Learning, K-12	8.4	Retain
<b>39</b>	UT Chattanooga	51.2308	Rehabilitation Sciences	9.2	Terminate
<b>40</b>	UT Health Science	51.1005	Medical Lab Science	7.6	Retain
<b>41</b>	UT Knoxville	03.0204	Natural Resources & Env Economics	2.3	Retain
<b>42</b>	UT Knoxville	51.1302	Business Analytics	2.5	Retain
<b>43</b>	UT Knoxville	16.0902	Italian	3.2	Consolidate
<b>44</b>	UT Knoxville	16.0402	Russian Studies	4.0	Consolidate
<b>45</b>	UT Knoxville	51.1005	Clinical Laboratory Science	4.2	Retain
<b>46</b>	UT Knoxville	30.9999	Pre-Professional Programs	5.2	Retain
<b>47</b>	UT Knoxville	16.0501	German	6.2	Consolidate
<b>48</b>	UT Knoxville	01.0801	Ag Leadership, Educ & Comm	7.5	Retain
<b>49</b>	UT Knoxville	27.0501	Statistics	8.8	Retain
<b>50</b>	UT Martin	50.0999	Music	1.6	Retain
<b>51</b>	UT Martin	16.0901	French	1.8	Terminate
<b>52</b>	UT Martin	38.0101	Philosophy	2.2	Retain
<b>53</b>	UT Martin	27.0101	Mathematics (4)	2.4	Retain
<b>54</b>	UT Martin	16.0905	Spanish	6.0	Retain
<b>55</b>	UT Martin	45.0901	International Studies	7.0	Retain
<b>56</b>	UT Martin	11.0701	Computer Science	8.0	Retain
<b>57</b>	UT Martin	13.1001	Special Education	8.0	Retain
<b>58</b>	UT Martin	40.0601	Geoscience	9.2	Retain

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>CIP Code</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Average</b>	<b>Board Recommendation</b>
	<b>Benchmark for Master's Programs: 5 graduates over a 5 year period</b>				
<b>1</b>	East Tennessee	51.2202	Environmental Health	1.0	Retain
<b>2</b>	East Tennessee	13.0401	Educational Leadership	4.2	Retain
<b>3</b>	East Tennessee	51.9999	Allied Health	4.3	Retain
<b>4</b>	Tennessee Tech	11.0701	Computer Science	2.6	Retain
<b>5</b>	Tennessee Tech	14.0701	Chemical Engineering	3.8	Retain
<b>6</b>	Tennessee Tech	27.0101	Mathematics	4.2	Retain
<b>7</b>	Univ of Memphis	42.2806	Educational Psychology & Research	2.5	Retain
<b>8</b>	Univ of Memphis	45.0601	Economics	2.6	Retain
<b>9</b>	UT Knoxville	26.9999	Comparative/Experimental Medicine	1.3	Retain
<b>10</b>	UT Knoxville	26.9999	Life Sciences	1.8	Retain
<b>11</b>	UT Knoxville	14.3201	Polymer Engineering	2.0	Terminate
<b>12</b>	UT Knoxville	26.0503	Microbiology	2.2	Retain
<b>13</b>	UT Knoxville	14.1301	Engineering Science	2.4	Retain
<b>14</b>	UT Knoxville	13.0401	Educational Administration	3.0	Retain
<b>15</b>	UT Knoxville	38.0101	Philosophy	3.0	Retain
<b>16</b>	UT Knoxville	26.0202	Biochem/Cell/Molecular Biology	3.2	Retain
<b>17</b>	UT Knoxville	16.0905	Spanish	3.6	Retain
<b>18</b>	UT Knoxville	01.1105	Entomology & Plant Pathology	3.8	Retain
<b>19</b>	UT Knoxville	16.0901	French	3.8	Retain
<b>20</b>	UT Knoxville	01.0901	Animal Science	4.0	Retain
<b>21</b>	UT Knoxville	26.1301	Ecology & Evolutionary Biology	4.0	Retain
<b>22</b>	UT Knoxville	01.1202	Environmental & Soil Sciences	4.0	Retain
<b>23</b>	UT Knoxville	03.0501	Forestry	4.4	Retain
<b>24</b>	UT Knoxville	40.0501	Chemistry	4.4	Retain
<b>25</b>	UT Health Science	51.2004	Pharmaceutical Sciences	1.0	Retain
<b>26</b>	UT Health Science	51.2212	Health Outcomes & Policy Research	1.0	Retain
<b>27</b>	UT Health Science	26.9999	Biomedical Sciences	3.5	Retain
<b>28</b>	UT Health Science	14.0501	Biomedical Engineering (joint program with Univ of Memphis)	4.3	Retain
<b>29</b>	UT Health Science	51.1002	Cytopathology Practice	4.3	Retain

	Institution	CIP Code	Academic Program	Average	Board Recommendation
<b>Benchmark for Doctoral Programs: 3 graduates over a 5 year period</b>					
1	East Tennessee	51.2201	Public Health	2.0	Retain
2	East Tennessee	42.0101	Psychology	2.0	Retain
3	East Tennessee	51.2202	Environmental Health Science	2.0	Retain
4	Tennessee State	14.0901	Computer & Info Systems Engineering	1.6	Retain
5	Tennessee State	44.0401	Public Administration	2.0	Retain
6	Univ of Memphis	51.0204	Comm Sciences/Disorders	2.2	Retain
7	UT Knoxville	14.0301	Biosystems Engineering	1.2	Retain
8	UT Knoxville	52.1301	Management Science	1.0	Retain
9	UT Knoxville	14.0201	Aerospace Engineering	1.4	Retain
10	UT Knoxville	01.0901	Animal Science	1.6	Retain
11	UT Knoxville	01.1001	Food Science And Technology	2.0	Retain
12	UT Knoxville	14.0701	Chemical Engineering	2.2	Retain
13	UT Knoxville	14.3201	Polymer Engineering	2.3	Terminate
14	UT Knoxville	14.0901	Computer Engineering	2.4	Retain
15	UT Knoxville	38.0101	Philosophy	2.4	Retain
16	UT Chattanooga	14.2701	Computational Engineering	1.8	Retain
17	UT Health Science	14.0501	Biomedical Engineering (joint program with Univ of Memphis)	1.3	Retain
18	UT Health Science	51.2212	Health Outcomes & Policy Research	2.0	Retain

	Community College	CIP Code	Academic Program	Degree Level	3 Yr. Average	Board Recommendation
<b>Benchmark for Certificate and Associate Programs: 10 graduates over a 3 year period</b>						
1	Chattanooga	52.0302	Accounting Technology	Associate	9	Retain
2	Chattanooga	50.0506	Acting: Professional	Certificate	9	Retain
3	Chattanooga	52.0302	Basic Bookkeeping	Certificate	0	Retain
4	Chattanooga	52.0302	Basic Tax Accounting	Certificate	0	Retain
5	Chattanooga	51.0901	Cardiovascular Sonography	Certificate	9	Retain
6	Chattanooga	51.0910	Diagnostic Medical Sonography	Certificate	9	Retain
7	Chattanooga	15.0612	Electrical & Instrumentation Systems	Certificate	1	Retain
8	Chattanooga	52.0701	Entrepreneurship	Certificate	--	Retain
9	Chattanooga	15.0612	Industrial Systems Engineering Tech	Associate	6	Retain
10	Chattanooga	15.0805	Mechanical Systems	Certificate	1	Retain
11	Chattanooga	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Retain
12	Chattanooga	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Retain
13	Chattanooga	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	--	Retain
14	Cleveland	13.0101	Teaching	Associate	1	Retain

	<b>Community College</b>	<b>CIP Code</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>	<b>3 Yr. Average</b>	<b>Board Recommendation</b>
<b>15</b>	Cleveland	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	--	Terminate
<b>16</b>	Cleveland	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Terminate
<b>17</b>	Cleveland	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Terminate
<b>18</b>	Columbia	50.9999	Commercial Entertainment	Certificate	9	Retain
<b>19</b>	Columbia	19.0706	Early Childhood Education	Certificate	6	Retain
<b>20</b>	Columbia	10.0201	Film Crew Technology	Certificate	6	Retain
<b>21</b>	Columbia	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Retain
<b>22</b>	Columbia	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Retain
<b>23</b>	Columbia	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	1	Retain
<b>24</b>	Dyersburg	43.0107	Corrections & Law Enforcement	Certificate	5	Retain
<b>25</b>	Dyersburg	43.0107	Criminal Justice	Associate	3	Retain
<b>26</b>	Dyersburg	32.0111	General Technology	Associate	3	Retain
<b>27</b>	Dyersburg	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Retain
<b>28</b>	Dyersburg	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	1	Retain
<b>29</b>	Dyersburg	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	3	Retain
<b>30</b>	Jackson	51.0904	EMT-Paramedic (1 year)	Certificate	3	Retain
<b>31</b>	Jackson	51.0904	EMT-Paramedic (2 year)	Certificate	9	Retain
<b>32</b>	Jackson	15.0612	Industrial Technology	Associate	9	Retain
<b>33</b>	Jackson	51.1004	Medical Lab Technician	Associate	9	Retain
<b>34</b>	Jackson	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Retain
<b>35</b>	Jackson	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Retain
<b>36</b>	Motlow	32.0111	General Technology	Associate	7	Retain
<b>37</b>	Motlow	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	1	Retain
<b>38</b>	Motlow	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Retain
<b>39</b>	Motlow	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	1	Retain
<b>40</b>	Nashville	50.0409	3D Design and Graphics	Certificate	2	Retain
<b>41</b>	Nashville	11.0101	Computer Info Systems	Associate	8	Retain
<b>42</b>	Nashville	01.0605	Horticulture & Land Gardening	Certificate	7	Retain
<b>43</b>	Nashville	46.0302	Industrial Electrical Maintenance	Certificate	6	Retain
<b>44</b>	Nashville	52.0203	Logistics	Certificate	2	Retain
<b>45</b>	Nashville	22.0302	Paralegal Studies	Associate	8	Retain
<b>46</b>	Nashville	50.0605	Photography	Associate	8	Retain
<b>47</b>	Nashville	52.0203	Supply Chain	Certificate	1	Retain
<b>48</b>	Nashville	13.0101	Teaching	Associate	8	Retain
<b>49</b>	Nashville	52.0203	Transportation	Certificate	1	Retain
<b>50</b>	Nashville	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	2	Terminate
<b>51</b>	Nashville	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	1	Terminate
<b>52</b>	Nashville	44.0201	Social Services	Associate	3	Terminate
<b>53</b>	Nashville	47.0604	Automotive Technology	Associate	4	Terminate

	<b>Community College</b>	<b>CIP Code</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>	<b>3 Yr. Average</b>	<b>Board Recommendation</b>
<b>54</b>	Nashville	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	2	Retain
<b>55</b>	Northeast	43.0107	Public Safety & Justice Admin	Associate	4	Retain
<b>56</b>	Northeast	13.0101	Teaching	Associate	9	Retain
<b>57</b>	Northeast	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	1	Retain
<b>58</b>	Northeast	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Retain
<b>59</b>	Northeast	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Retain
<b>60</b>	Pellissippi	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	1	Retain
<b>61</b>	Roane	11.0101	Computer Science	Certificate	2	Retain
<b>62</b>	Roane	45.0702	Geographic Info Systems	Associate	3	Retain
<b>63</b>	Roane	22.0302	Paralegal Studies	Associate	7	Retain
<b>64</b>	Roane	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	1	Terminate
<b>65</b>	Roane	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Terminate
<b>66</b>	Roane	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Terminate
<b>67</b>	Roane	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Certificate	7	Retain
<b>68</b>	Southwest	15.0303	Basic Electronics Technician	Certificate	8	Retain
<b>69</b>	Southwest	26.1201	Biotechnology	Associate	8	Retain
<b>70</b>	Southwest	52.0101	Customs Brokerage	Certificate	3	Retain
<b>71</b>	Southwest	51.3104	Dietetic Technician	Associate	6	Retain
<b>72</b>	Southwest	47.0101	Electronic Technology	Associate	5	Retain
<b>73</b>	Southwest	19.0505	Food Preparation, Safety & Service	Certificate	9	Retain
<b>74</b>	Southwest	13.0101	Teaching	Associate	4	Retain
<b>75</b>	Southwest	52.0201	Mid-Management	Associate	6	Terminate
<b>76</b>	Southwest	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	2	Retain
<b>77</b>	Southwest	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Retain
<b>78</b>	Southwest	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Retain
<b>79</b>	Volunteer	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Terminate
<b>80</b>	Volunteer	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Terminate
<b>81</b>	Volunteer	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	2	Retain
<b>82</b>	Walters	32.0111	General Technology	Associate	--	Retain
<b>83</b>	Walters	01.0601	Horticulture	Certificate	3	Retain
<b>84</b>	Walters	01.0605	Landscape Management	Certificate	--	Retain
<b>85</b>	Walters	01.0603	Production Horticulture	Associate	5	Retain
<b>86</b>	Walters	24.0102	Professional Studies (RODP)	Associate	2	Terminate
<b>87</b>	Walters	11.0801	Web Page Authoring (RODP)	Certificate	--	Terminate
<b>88</b>	Walters	11.0301	Information Technology	Associate	4	Terminate
<b>89</b>	Walters	11.0801	Web Technology (RODP)	Associate	--	Retain