



Tennessee Commission on Education Recovery and Innovation

December 3, 2021

Today's goals and agenda

We're anticipating two primary goals for the December meeting:

- 1) Determine whether to include recommendations related to EPP accountability in the Year 3 report
- 2) Begin the conversation about success metrics

| Friday, December 3 | |
|--------------------|---|
| Start | Activity |
| 9:00 | Gaveling, roll call, business items |
| 9:15 | Overview of goals and agenda |
| 9:20 | Preview plan for Year 3 |
| 9:30 | Update from THEC re: textbook cost study |
| 9:40 | Discuss EPP data, reporting, and accountability |
| 10:40 | Begin metrics conversation |
| 11:55 | Next steps |
| 12:00 | Adjourn |

We sent a pre-work survey to gather your input on Year 3; here's a summary of the results

Content still to cover:

Outstanding from November meeting

- School choice
- Innovation
- Alignment between sec and postsec
- Curriculum (other than ELA and math)
- EPP data and accountability
- Success metrics
- Prioritization criteria/guiding questions

Suggested by commissioners in survey

- School accountability (6 said yes)
- Teacher comp and benefits (7 said yes)
- Postsecondary course options (e.g., hybrid, what's required, how they build to certificates vs. degrees)

We are covering these two items today

Potential student engagement:

- 7 commissioners interested in a site visit
- 6 commissioners prefer in-person
- 6 commissioners prefer to hear from students at different stages in the education pipeline

Ranking of age preferences:

| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------|---|---|---|---|
| HS | 4 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| TCAT | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 |
| CC | 1 | 0 | 4 | 1 |
| 4-year | 0 | 1 | 1 | 4 |

Survey data based on responses from 8 commissioners

Based on your input, we've put together a high-level plan for next year's sequence of meetings

| Meeting date | Proposed content |
|-------------------|---|
| December 3, 2021 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Conversation with Amy Owens re: EPP data and accountability ● Begin success metrics conversation (will continue this conversation in February and April) |
| Independent work | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Commissioners review content modules on new topic areas ● Bellwether conducts 1:1s with commissioners |
| February 11, 2022 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Discuss content and recs related to remaining topic areas ● Guest speakers on innovation |
| Independent work | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Bellwether outlines the Year 3 report and gathers feedback from commissioners ● Bellwether tracks the legislative session and updates commissioners as needed |
| April 29, 2022 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Discuss content and recs related to school choice; guest speakers TBD ● Finalize any outstanding recommendations ● Discuss and align on the Year 3 report outline |
| Independent work | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Bellwether drafts the Year 3 report, gathers feedback from commissioners, and revises ● Bellwether tracks the legislative session and updates commissioners as needed |
| June 10, 2022 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Discuss feedback and make final revisions to the Year 3 report ● Adopt the Year 3 report |

Note that Kelly will be going on leave in February and another Bellwether associate partner will be taking over for her

**Update from THEC re:
costs of course materials**

EPP data and accountability

Amy Owen, SBOE

In November, ERIC voted to hold off making a recommendation related to EPP accountability until they had more information

Reminder: the recommendation under consideration read...

- *Use existing state-collected data on educator preparation programs, including licensure pass rates, to inform program approval decisions*

What was the original context for making this recommendation?

- ERIC discussed at length in July and September whether to include a recommendation related to strengthening entry requirements to EPP programs and ultimately decided to focus instead on holding programs accountable for their outcomes

What questions arose in November that we need to clarify?

- What data are collected for public **transparency** (i.e., report cards)?
- What data are used to approve programs and hold them **accountable**?
- What **changes need to be made** to strengthen accountability and ultimately ensure that only high-quality programs continue to educate pre-service teachers in TN?

Based on what you know now, does ERIC want to include a recommendation related to EPP accountability in the Year 3 report?

Success metrics

ERIC also voted to revisit the conversation about success metrics in Year 3; today we're starting that conversation

Reminder: We had a conversation toward the end of the November meeting about identifying some metrics to help the legislature measure the success of any of ERIC's recommendations that they implement, and to help legislators prioritize among the recommendations included in ERIC's Year 2 report.

We will NOT finish this conversation today; we are planning for it to be an ongoing agenda item between now and April to ensure commissioners have adequate time to read, learn, and discuss before aligning on a set of success metrics to recommend to the legislature. The table below shows how we're anticipating the arc of this conversation:

| | |
|------------------------------|--|
| December 2021 (today) | <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Revisit "what success looks like"● Review existing state metrics● Review similar metrics from other states● Align on categories for metrics |
| February 2022 | <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Review, discuss, and narrow draft metrics in each category |
| April 2022 | <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Vote on final set of metrics to include in Year 3 report |

Recall: Back in May, commissioners generated a definition of what success looks like if ERIC's vision is realized

Success looks like individuals who:

- Are **lifelong learners**, as measured by certifications and degrees achieved
- Gain **employment** in a field related to their field of study
- Earn a **livable wage** and can support a family
- Have dignity, a sense of self-worth, and can **make choices**
- Have **critical thinking and teamwork** skills
- Are **good citizens**, meaning they vote, volunteer, and are self-sufficient

A successful system would:

- Be tied to **current needs**
- Be student-centric and **serve all students**
- Be **nimble**, flexible, and adaptable
- Be **hospitable to families**

Tennessee currently has a handful of education and workforce-related goals and related metrics in place (1/2)

Elementary and Secondary

By 2025...

- 75% of Tennessee **third graders** will be proficient in **reading**.
- 75% of **English Learners** will meet the appropriate **growth** standard on WIDA ACCESS (an English-language proficiency assessment).
- Tennessee will achieve a 50% **reduction** in the number of high school students **not meeting the on-track or mastered level** on the state's annual subject matter assessments:
 - Math (2015-16 Baseline: 20.8%; 2024-25 Goal: 65.4%)
 - ELA (2015-16 Baseline: 20.4%; 2024-25 Goal: 69.6%)
 - Science (2015:16 Baseline: 48.9%; 2024-25 Goal: 77.6%)
- Tennessee will reach a 95%, **four-year adjusted cohort high school graduation rate** for all students.

Tennessee currently has a handful of education and workforce-related goals and related metrics in place (2/2)

Postsecondary and Workforce Development

- By 2024, **double** the number of Tennessee learners who **participate in high-quality work-based learning experiences** and **attain the relevant certificates, credentials, and/or degrees** needed to meet the workforce demands of Tennessee. *(2020 Baseline: 9.4%; 2024 Target: 18.8%)*
- By 2024, substantially increase the number of students **accessing aligned pathways, participating in high quality learning experiences, and on track to meet postsecondary goals two years after graduation** as measured by: 2- and 4- year college persistence, technical certificate attainment, military enlistment, workforce participation, and similar paths.
- By 2025, 55% of Tennesseans will **possess a college degree or certificate**.
- Increase the proportion of students **enrolling in degree programs that lead to employment** in high-need fields (i.e. software developers; medical, dental, and physical therapist assistants; and biological technicians) by at least 5% annually.

Tennessee has a variety of goals in place already; ERIC needs to decide whether and how to use them

Given what the state has in place already, there a few options for ERIC:

1. Point the legislature to **all of these existing goals and metrics and recommend they use them** as success metrics for relevant ERIC recommendation
2. Select **a subset of these existing goals and metrics** and recommend the legislature use them as success metrics for relevant ERIC recommendations
3. Add **additional success metrics** to the existing list (or subset)
4. Create a **completely new set** of success metrics

What approach do commissioners feel is best?

Let's try to align on 3-4 *categories* of success; we'll define exact metrics in coming meetings

| Question for consideration | Potential categories |
|---|---|
| What is the ideal end goal? | <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Employment/workforce participation● Annual wages● Voter participation |
| What postsecondary categories should the legislature look at? | <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Postsecondary enrollment● Postsecondary certificate/degree completion |
| What K-12 categories should the legislature look at? | <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Reading proficiency● Math proficiency● High school graduation● Ready Graduate● EPSO participation |

Other states have similar goals and metrics that could serve as examples for Tennessee (1/2)

Examples of K-12 Goals and Metrics

- **California** set the goal of **100% of third graders being proficient in reading** (“standard met”) by 2026.
- **Utah** set the goal of **60% of third graders annually meeting their growth goal** in reading with support mechanisms legislated.
- **Louisiana’s ESSA** goals include **annually increase its proficiency rates** (basic and above) **by 2.5 percentage points per year** from 2018-2025.
- **Wyoming** set a **long-term goal for high school math**: by 2031 that all **high schools will perform as well or better than schools that performed at or above the 65th percentile** in math during the baseline year (2015-16).
- **Connecticut** set a goal of **100% of students reaching their individual growth targets** by 2030 (measured by individual change or growth over time).

Other states have similar goals and metrics that could serve as examples for Tennessee (2/2)

Examples of Postsecondary and Career Goals and Metrics

- **Colorado** set a goal of 66% of its **25-34 year olds** holding a **postsecondary credential** by 2025.
- **Massachusetts** set a goal of 70% of its **25-64 year olds** holding a **postsecondary credential** by 2030.
- **Arizona's Education Progress Meter** established a slate of statewide achievement goals in 2017 to be **attained by 2030**. The goals include:
 - **70% of students enrolled in higher education** a semester after high school graduation.
 - **60% of Arizonans with a degree or certificate.**

According to the National Governors Association, the “most promising” examples of credential attainment goals combine a long-term goal with measurable, shorter-term goal, and metrics that align state, federal, and private funding across the education and workforce system.

Next steps

Adjourn