Agenda Item: II.A

DATE: April 28, 2011

SUBJECT: Performance of New Academic Programs: 2005-2010

ACTION RECOMMENDED: Information

BACKGROUND INFORMATION: In accordance with statutory requirements, the Tennessee Higher Education Commission evaluates both new and existing academic degree programs to ensure their quality and viability. In the case of newly approved programs, this evaluation occurs in the form of the Post Approval Monitoring program.

Following approval, newly approved programs remain in the Post Approval Monitoring cycle for five years at the baccalaureate level and above and three years for pre-baccalaureate programs. This review evaluates the new program against benchmarks in enrollment and graduation, program cost, program progress toward accreditation, and other goals agreed upon by the governing boards and THEC through program authorization. It is also important to note that only those programs approved by THEC are monitored under this protocol. Certificates of less than 24 hours are approved by the governing boards, and do not submit Post Approval Monitoring reports.

Governing boards are notified when programs fail to meet these benchmarks, and Post Approval Monitoring findings are an integral part of the annual THEC Academic Program Review. In those cases where programs fail to meet standards or improve during the course of the monitoring period, THEC may recommend termination. Upon completion of the Post Approval Monitoring term, academic programs transition to monitoring under the annual Low Producing report.

Under recent academic policy revisions (Academic Policy A1.0 and A1.1) adopted earlier this year, institutions are expected to engage in a more rigorous feasibility study and financial projection than previously required. To assist in this evaluation, a summative review was conducted regarding the performance of new academic programs that have completed the Post Approval Monitoring cycle. Institutions considering the proposal of new academic programs should consult this review to assess two areas:

1) The degree to which programs proposed by the institution have achieved or failed to achieve projected benchmarks, and

2) The degree to which similar academic programs at other institutions achieved or failed to achieve projected benchmarks.

This information provides valuable insight into the accuracy of the benchmarks utilized in the development of past academic programs, as well as the potential market demand for specific types of programs across the state. However, it must

1

be stressed that it is unrealistic to expect a new program to produce graduates prior to the juncture at which a student could reasonably negotiate the course requirements. The first year in which graduate yield can be expected is at the fourth year for the Doctoral level, at the Master's level in the second year, the Bachelor's level the fourth year, and at the second year in an Associate program. Therefore, this evaluation focused primarily on performance during the final year of implementation (fifth year for Doctoral-Bachelor, third year for Associate and below).

2010 Post Approval Monitoring Review Conclusions

- 24 programs reached the conclusion of Post Approval Monitoring during 2010. Of those, the majority failed to achieve benchmark projections in either graduation or enrollment set by the institution during the program proposal process.

- 7 programs attained both enrollment and graduation benchmarks during the final year of monitoring

- 4 programs attained either graduation or enrollment benchmarks during the final year of monitoring

- 13 programs did not attain graduation or enrollment benchmarks set by the institution.

- While two-thirds of the programs monitored during this period are not in compliance with the graduate production numbers required to be considered a productive program in the future, the vast majority have a sufficient number of enrolled students so as to facilitate attainment of those standards in the next year.

Review of Enrollment and Graduation. Post Approval Monitoring occurs in a five year cycle for degree programs at the Bachelor level and higher, and a three year cycle for programs at the Associate level and below. This year will conclude the monitoring cycle for Doctoral, Master's, and Bachelor programs that were implemented during the 2005-06 academic year, and Associate and Certificate programs implemented during the 2007-08 academic year. While this report covers only those programs, the full spectrum of programs currently under Post-Approval Monitoring is included in Appendix A. Information utilized for this review was gathered from the annual Post Approval Monitoring template submitted by each institution. These data were utilized to determine the projected and actual enrollment and the projected graduates. THEC Report of Graduates data from 2009-10 was utilized for the actual graduates.

The transition from Post Approval Monitoring offers valuable insight into whether the perceived need for an academic program proved to be accurate, as well as whether the projections that were developed during the proposal process have been attained. In the vast majority of cases, the programs monitored during this timeframe did not meet the projections that were developed by the institution. Table 1 depicts the projected enrollment and graduation for each program and compares it with the actual numbers in both areas.

Table 1
Tennessee Higher Education Commission
Performance of New Academic Programs, 2005-10

Doctoral Programs	Year 1		Year 2		Year 3		Year 4		Year 5	
MTSU- PhD, Public History	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual
Headcount - Enrollment	13	12	18	16	23	19	28	21	33	20
Graduates	1	0	1	0	2	1	2	1	4	8
UTK - PhD, Computer Engineering										
Headcount - Enrollment	16	3	17	2	18	8	19	21	20	21
Graduates	5	0	7	0	9	7	11	1	13	1
UTC- EdD, Learning/Leadership										
Headcount - Enrollment	20	19	35	38	50	55	61	66	68	80
Graduates	0	0	0	0	0	1	5	1	10	11
UTHSC- ScDPT, Physical Therapy										
Headcount - Enrollment	6	6	14	2	21	3	23	14	28	2
Graduates	0	2	0	0	0	0	6	6	7	0

Master's Programs										
MTSU- MFA, Recording Arts										
Headcount - Enrollment	10	12	19	21	28	27	34	30	44	35
Graduates	0	0	0	0	5	9	7	7	10	6
MTSU- MS, Professional Science										
Headcount - Enrollment	12	20	26	39	30	51	42	59	55	57
Graduates	0	1	5	4	9	19	15	21	20	20
Memphis- MS, Bioinformatics										
Headcount - Enrollment	8	2	14	7	16	11	18	7	18	11
Graduates	0	0	3	0	6	2	7	8	8	3
UTK- MS, Computer Engineering										
Headcount - Enrollment	25	5	30	5	35	14	40	19	45	19
Graduates	15	1	20	0	25	6	30	4	35	13

Tennessee Higher Education Commission
Performance of New Academic Programs, 2005-10

Bachelor Programs	Year 1		Year 2		Year 3		Year 4		Year 5	
APSU- BS, Criminal Justice	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual
Headcount - Enrollment	45	100	90	149	135	206	158	235	175	272
Graduates	0	2	10	16	20	36	25	60	25	62
ETSU- BS, Geology										
Headcount - Enrollment	14	0	18	11	22	20	24	30	24	29
Graduates	0	0	2	0	4	3	5	5	5	4
U of M- BS, Biomed. Engineering										
Headcount - Enrollment	16	15	32	35	50	70	68	116	86	76
Graduates	0	0	0	0	0	0	8	10	12	8
MTSU- Construction Management										
Headcount - Enrollment	60	70	76	101	100	148	110	158	126	163
Graduates	12	10	12	14	15	13	18	34	20	29
UTK- BSC, Public Relations										
Headcount - Enrollment	10	43	20	41	35	76	45	81	55	121
Graduates	0	3	10	20	15	51	25	63	30	55

Associate Programs						
Chatt. State- Dental Assisting						
Headcount - Enrollment	36	35	36	34	36	35
Graduates	36	25	36	26	36	28
Chatt. State- Cardio Sonography						
Headcount - Enrollment	14	11	16		17	21
Graduates	10	11	12	11	13	18
Chatt. State- Vet Tech						
Headcount - Enrollment	48	28	48	30	48	36
Graduates	20	8	20	9	20	6
Columbia State- Film Crew						
Headcount - Enrollment	9	0	21	8	28	9
Graduates	3	0	8	0	12	3

Tennessee Higher Education Commission
Performance of New Academic Programs, 2005-10

Associate Programs	Year 1		Year 2		Year 3	
Dyersburg- General Technology	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual
Headcount - Enrollment	9	5	13	5	15	13
Graduates	1	0	3	1	4	3
Motlow- General Technology						
Headcount - Enrollment	9	0	14	17	17	27
Graduates	1	0	3	5	4	8
Nashville- Industrial Process						
Headcount - Enrollment	17	29	25	36	30	55
Graduates	0	5	10	10	18	10
RODP- Web Authoring						
Headcount - Enrollment	20	4	26		38	11
Graduates	5	2	8		10	5
RODP- Web Technology						
Headcount	42	2	49		53	4
Graduates	0	2	11		26	0
Walters- General Technology						
Headcount - Enrollment	12	4	15	3	16	3
Graduates	0	1	3	0	5	0
Walters- Information Technology						
Headcount - Enrollment	13	3	16	16	20	29
Graduates	0	0	7	1	9	0

Low Producing Analysis. During the Post Approval Monitoring cycle, programs are measured against benchmarks determined by the institution. However, upon reaching maturity, the program is measured against nationally recognized standards (10 or more graduates at the Bachelor level and below, 5 or more graduates at the Master's level and 3 or more at the Doctoral level).

Based on these standards and program performance in the final year of monitoring, the majority of the academic programs included in this evaluation would have qualified as low-producing. However, in many of the programs that have failed to achieve productivity thresholds, there are a sufficient number of students enrolled that there appears to that productivity standards will be likely be attained during the next monitoring cycle. The Ph.D in Public History at MTSU, the M.S. in Computer Engineering at UT-Knoxville, the B.S. in Geology at ETSU and the A.A.S. in Industrial Process at Nashville State are specific examples of this steady improvement.

However, in other cases, the program experienced either sporadic or minimal growth during the entirety of the Post Approval Monitoring cycle and also have few students enrolled (Table 2). These programs appear likely to emerge as degree fields that will become low producing.

Table 2
Low Producing Program Analysis

Institution	Program	Average # of Graduates	# Students Currently Enrolled
Memphis	MS, Bioinformatics	3	11
UT-HSC	ScDPT-Physical Therapy	2	2
Columbia State	Certificate, Film Crew Tech.	1	9
RODP	AAS, Web Technology	1	4
RODP	Certificate, Web Authoring	2	4
Walters State	AAS, General Technology	0	3

Financial Information. The Post Approval Monitoring process also includes an assessment of the financial expenditures of the program. In most cases, any deviation from projected revenue was compensated by an intake of tuition and fees that also exceeded projections. In those programs that did not utilize existing resources and required new expenditures, institutions appear to be making realistic financial projections.

Conclusions. While many of these programs ultimately appear to be on a path to success, programs monitored during this period often did not achieve the benchmarks that were self-developed by institutions. In fact, projections were off by a wide margin in most cases. This is an important resource allocation issue for systems and institutions, as those projections serve as the basis for financial and program planning purposes. Full exploration of the questions and issues embedded within the THEC Letter of Intent process will be a significant first step in ensuring that planning for new academic programs becomes a more accurate predictor of program performance.

Appendix A
Post Approval Monitoring Cycles

Institution	Program Name	Degree	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
MTSU	Global Studies	BA	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
UT Chattanooga	Mechanical Engineering	BS	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
UT Chattanooga	Electrical Engineering	BS	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
UT Martin	Finance	BSBA	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
TSU	Physical Therapy	DPT	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
ETSU	Public Health	Dr.P.H.	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
APSU	Military History	MA	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
UTHSC	Dental Hygiene	MDH	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
TSU	Occupational Therapy	MOT	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
RODP	Professional Studies	MPS	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
UTHSC	Cytopathology Practice	MS	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
UoM	Computer Science	MS	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
ETSU	Allied Health	MSAH	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
ETSU	Pharmacy	PharmD	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
UoM	Computer Science	PhD	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
ETSU	Women's Studies	BA	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
ETSU	Theatre	BA	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
ETSU	Anthropology	BA	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
UoM	Architecture	M.Arch.	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
APSU	Teaching	MAT	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
UoM	Public Health	MPH	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
UT Knoxville	Reliability and Maintainability Engineering	MS	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
UT Knoxville	Biomedical Engineering	MS	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
UTHSC	Health Informatics & Information Management	MS	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
UT Knoxville	Biomedical Engineering	Ph.D.	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
ETSU	Clinical Psychology	PhD	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
ETSU	Environmental Health	PhD	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
Jackson	Occupational Therapy Assistant	AAS*	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11		
Nashville	Paralegal Studies	AAS	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11		

Appendix A
Post Approval Monitoring Cycles

Institution	Program Name	Degree	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Nashville	Healthcare Management	AAS	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11		
UT Chattanooga	Early Childhood Education	BS	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
TSU	Urban Studies	BS	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	Landscape Architecture	MLA, MA, MS	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	Educational Psychology & Research	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	School Psychology	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	Counselor Education	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	Higher Education Administration	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	Exercise & Sports Science	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	Nutritional Sciences	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	Child & Family Studies	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
UT Knoxville	Retail, Hospitality, & Tourism Management	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
ETSU	Early Childhood Education	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
MTSU	Literacy Studies	PhD	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13
Nashville	Office Administration	Tech Certificate	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11		
Nashville	Accounting Technology	Tech Certificate	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11		
Nashville	Medical Transcription	Tech Certificate	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11		
Nashville	Medical Coding	Tech Certificate	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11		
APSU	Chemical Eng Tech	A.A.S	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
Dyersburg	EMS	AAS	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
Nashville	Logistics Technology	AAS	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
Southwest	EMS- Paramedic	AAS	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
Volunteer	Crim. Justice/Law Enforcement	AAS	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
ETSU	International Affairs	BA	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
MTSU	Exercise Science	BS	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14

Institution	Program Name	Degree	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
MTSU	Forensic Science	BS	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
UT Chattanooga	Athletic Training	MS	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
UT Chattanooga	Mathematics	MS	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
MTSU	Math/Science Ed.	PhD	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
MTSU	Molecular Bioscience	PhD	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
MTSU	Computational Science	PhD	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
Dyersburg	Paramedic	Tech Certificate	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
Nashville	3D Design & Graphics	Tech Certificate	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
Walters	Clean Energy	AAS	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13		
Roane	Allied Health	AAS	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13		
East Tennessee	Bluegrass, Old Time and Country Music	BA	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
Univ of Memphis	Interior Design	BFA	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
UT Chattanooga	Chemical Engineering	BS	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
UT Chattanooga	Civil Engineering	BS	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
UT Chattanooga	Nursing Practice	DNP	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
Middle Tennessee	Horse Science	Masters	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
Univ of Memphis	Social and Behavioral Science	PhD	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
Chattanooga	EMT	Certificate	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
Volunteer	Veterinary Technology	AAS	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14		
Chattanooga	General Engineering	AAS	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14		
UT Knoxville	Nursing Practice	DNP	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16
Univ of Memphis	Social Work	MSW	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16
UT Knoxville	Energy Science and Engineering	PhD	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16
East Tennessee	Nursing Practice	DNP	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16